

Updated Below --- See Appendix B

Is the CoB's Louis K. Brandt Research Award Increasingly Becoming a Political Football?

Award Winners by Year

| | 1993 | 1995 | 1997 | 1999 | 2001 | 2003 | 2005 |
|----------------------------|----------------------------|--|------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------|--------------|---------------|
| | Lindley, Tom Robin, Don | Babin, Barry Goffe, Bill Henthorne, T. | Dickie, Mark Mixon, Frank | Babin, Barry Niroomand, F.† | Nissan, Ed | Mixon, Frank | Babin, Barry‡ |
| Research Period Covered | 1991-92 | 1993-94 | 1995-96 | 1997-98 | 1999-00 | 2001-02 | 2003-04 |

† Niroomand was serving as Acting Chair of the Department of Economics and International Business at the time he was awarded the Brandt Award in 1999. At about the same time, he was also being elevated to Associate Dean of the CBA for the upcoming academic year (i.e., 1999-2000),

‡ At the time he received the Brandt Award in 2005, Babin was in negotiation with CoB Dean Harold Doty to assume the Chairperson role for the Department of Management, Marketing and Fashion Merchandising. The negotiation was successful, as Babin was elevated to that role for the 2005-2006 academic year.

Louis K. Brandt Research Award

The Louis K. Brandt Research Award is given during the Spring semester of odd-numbered years (e.g., 2005) to the CoB faculty member who has produced the most distinguished record of scholarship over the previous two calendar years (e.g., 2003-2004). Under normal procedure, the recipient(s) is (are) chosen based on the advice of an outside reviewer, who is chosen by the college's central administration. Winners of the Award are not eligible to receive the award in the next award cycle. The Award was set up through private contributions to the USM Foundation in the name of a former business college professor, and it is accompanied by a lump-sum payment that usually ranges from \$2,000 to \$2,500. In the case of multiple recipients, the Award stipend is divided accordingly.

Recent History of the Award

The table above presents all winners of the Louis K. Brandt Research Award from 1993-2005. Over the seven most recent Award cycles, there were multiple recipients on four separate occasions. A recent trend of solo winners seems to have developed since the 1999 Award. Winners have come from economics, finance, and marketing, with economics and marketing dominating the Award since 1993. Barry Babin, Professor of Marketing, has won the Award on three separate occasions since 1993 (1995, 1999 and 2005).

Another Recent Trend is a Disturbing One

Examination of the symbols contained in the Table above reveals another recent trend involving the Brandt Award, one of faculty holding or negotiating administrative positions winning the research honor. A previous report on the Brandt Award suggested that CoB administrators may be using promotion stipends as a substitute for merit raises for faculty during years when both apply. In odd-numbered years, they might also use Brandt Award monies as substitutes for merit raises that might have otherwise gone to Brandt Award winners. Doing so allows CoB administrators to spread merit raise monies around to others in the College (see previous report). Analysis in the previous report did not refute this contention in most cases. One exception was the case of 1999, when one of the co-winners (Niroomand) also received the second highest merit raise among CoB faculty. As the previous report (and the Table above) indicates, Niroomand held an administrative post (Chair) and was negotiating a promotion (to Associate Dean) at the time he won the award. As such, he was part of the merit raise process and was able to adequately represent his financial interests at the time. Other Award winners, like those in 1995, 1997 and 1999, were not as well positioned and consequently fared somewhat worse in the merit raise races those particular years.

The 2005 Brandt Award is the subject of this report given that a soon-to-be administrator, Barry Babin, took home the Award that year. The circumstances surrounding that event are bizarre to say the least.

The 2005 Award: CoB Meets Watergate

The story of the 2005 Brandt Award begins on a strange note, when the Annual CoB Spring Awards Banquet comes and goes and no winner is announced. Shortly after the meeting, the CoB's administrative team is reminded of the omission, and they send out a *mea culpa* ("we forgot") and called for nominations.

Barry Babin and John Clark (Assistant Professor of Finance) soon emerge as the frontrunners based on scholarship produced during the 2003-2004 period. As the Table above indicates, Babin was ultimately named the winner of the Award. Shortly thereafter, stories began to spread that he (Babin) had been appointed by Doty to chair the Department of Management, Marketing and Fashion Merchandising, succeeding long-time Chair Alvin Williams (Professor of Marketing). The stories proved true, as Babin was

appointed to Chair the Department beginning 2005-2006. As has been reported in the media and is available via open records access, Babin successfully negotiated a \$26,559 raise, stretching his USM salary to \$122,000 per year.

At about the same time that promotion rumors began, other stories began to circulate suggesting that the Award process didn't adequately compare the two researchers' productivities. It was suggested that an in-house journal swung the pendulum in Babin's favor, thus costing Clark the Brandt Award.

A recent examination of *Business Source Elite* allows for a post-Award comparison of the two. In the space below, research published between 2003-2005 (2005 included given publication time lags) is compared for the two finalists:

John Clark

Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science 2005 (w/ Cornwell & Pruitt)
[A-Level]
Quarterly Review of Economics & Finance 2004 (w/Giannetti & Anderson)
[B-Level]
Journal of Advertising Research 2004 (w/Pruitt & Cornwell)
[B-Level]
Financial Review 2003 (w/ Bhargava)
[A-Level]

Barry Babin

Journal of Services Marketing 2005 (w/ Lee, Kim & Griffin)
[C-Level]
Journal of Business Research 2004 (w/ Griffin & Boles)
[A-Level]
Journal of Business Research 2004 (w/ Griffin & Christensen)
[A-Level]
Journal of Business Research 2003 (w/ Hardesty & Suter)
[A-Level]

At first glance the two portfolios present a difficult comparison. They offer essentially the same average quality, although Clark's demonstrates a smaller variance (journal ratings taken CoB journals ranking lists). Clark's work averages 2.75 authors/paper, while Babin's averages 3.25 authors/paper. Without any other information, perhaps the nod goes to Clark, who had never won the Award prior to 2005. However, as the research productivity tables presented on this site point out, there was other, pertinent information. Babin was serving as the Marketing Editor of the *Journal of Business Research* over the relevant period under examination. As such, he faced a rejection probability of essentially 0.00 on the centerpiece of his 2005 Brandt portfolio.

Looking to the Future

Perhaps it's time for CoB administrators to disqualify themselves from participation in this process. Not surprisingly, this story entails more intrigue than is presented here. A supplement report may be forthcoming to deal with that. In the meantime, maybe Dr. Clark can rest in the peace of believing that winning the Brandt Award is not all that good for him anyway (see previous report). Only time will tell.

Appendix A

This report has been expanded based on the receipt of SEDONA records (as of 5-2-2006 for all CoB faculty) and use of the *Business Source Complete* online data source. Four additional publication records for Clark and Babin were found using these additional resources. They are presented below for comparison:

John Clark

Journal of Business Ethics 2003 (w/ Ferrell & Ferrell)

[C-Level]

Global Business and Economic Review 2003 (w/ Anderson)

[Other]

Journal of Financial Planning 2003 (w/ Gardner)

[Other]

Journal of Business and Economics Research 2003 (w/ Ward)

[Other]

Barry Babin

Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services 2004 (w/ Chebat & Michon)

[Other]

Journal of Consumer Behavior 2003 (w/ Cleveland, Laroche, Ward & Bergeron)

[Other]

International Journal of Bank Marketing 2003 (w/ Chebat & Kollias)

[Other]

Journal of Int. Consumer Marketing 2003 (w/ Laroche, Cleveland, & Ward)

[C-Level]

These supplemental packages (of 4 journals each) offer essentially the same average quality and variance (journal ratings taken CoB journals ranking lists), although Clark's list averages 2.25 authors/paper, while Babin's averages 3.75 authors/paper. However, these additional lists would likely not have factored into the Louis K. Brandt Research Award for 2005.

Appendix B

This report has been expanded again based on a communication with a usmpride.com reader that came as a result of the recent report, "The Babin Textbook Factory." We were informed that the outside reviewer of the 2005 Louis K. Brandt Award applications of Barry Babin and John Clark is believed to have been Professor Carl McDaniel of the University of Texas at Arlington. He is a co-author of the now familiar Thomson-Southwestern marketing principles textbook shown below:

[Thomson Higher Education](#) > [Marketing](#) > [Principles of Marketing](#)



Marketing (with InfoTrac), 8th Edition

Charles W. Lamb - Texas Christian University

Joseph F. Hair - Louisiana State University

Carl McDaniel - University of Texas, Arlington

ISBN-10: 032422155X | ISBN-13: 9780324221558

768 Pages HB 8 1/2 x 10 7/8 Dimension © 2006 Available Now

[Request Review Copy](#)

[Student Companion Site](#)

[Instructor Companion site](#)

[McDaniel's bio, as found on the textbook's homepage at Thomson Learning, is as follows:](#)

Carl McDaniel

Carl McDaniel is Professor of Marketing at the University of Texas-Arlington where he has been chairman of the marketing department since 1976. He has been an instructor for more than 20 years and is the recipient of several awards for outstanding teaching. McDaniel has also been a district sales manager for Southwestern Bell Telephone Company. Currently, he serves as a board member of the North Texas Higher Education Authority.

[Thus, this reader's tip adds more intrigue to the story, further suggesting that John Clark had little chance of winning the 2005 Award from the beginning.](#)